

Site Address:	The Steading/ Lodge, Inchgarth Road, Aberdeen, AB15 9NX
Application Description:	Complete demolition of the Steading and Lodge to allow reinstatement of Inchgarth House and surrounding landscape
Application Reference:	170610/LBC
Application Type	Listed Building Consent
Application Date:	26 May 2017
Applicant:	Kirkwood Homes Ltd Technical Department
Ward:	Lower Deeside
Community Council	Garthdee
Case Officer:	Sepideh Hajisoltani



© Crown Copyright. Aberdeen City Council. Licence Number: 100023401 - 2018

RECOMMENDATION

Approve Unconditionally

APPLICATION BACKGROUND

Site Description

The application site is located to the south of Inchgarth Road and is currently occupied by two semi-detached dwellings - 'Inchgarth Lodge' and 'The Steading'. These much altered granite buildings are situated within the curtilage of Inchgarth House which is a category 'C' Listed Building. The site lies within Pitfodels Conservation Area.

Relevant Planning History

P110529- Detailed planning permission for erection of new flat roofed extension to accommodate new kitchen and utility room was approved unconditionally in July 2011.

P111556 & P111557- Listed building consent and detailed planning permission for demolition of existing garage and port, erection of new store, garage block and colonnade, conversion of house and 2 flats back to one main house and refurbishment of all windows was approved conditionally in January 2012.

P140684- Detailed planning permission for erection of single storey rear extension was approved conditionally in July 2014.

P150523 & P150524- Detailed planning permission and listed building consent for removal of existing block garage and single storey extension to north east elevation, conversion of house and 2 flats back to one house, erection of new extensions to north east and north west elevations and refurbishment of all windows was approved conditionally in June 2015. This has been implemented.

P160782- Detailed planning permission for erection of 2 storey garage with ancillary space; formation of an opening in the boundary wall to create access gate and a driveway was withdrawn by applicant in September 2016.

170020/DPP- Detailed planning permission for construction of triple garage with ancillary accommodation at upper level was withdrawn by applicant in March 2017.

171921/DPP- Detailed planning permission for formation of new access and driveway with gate, wall and pillars, erection of a two storey detached garage and a single storey storage building and associated landscaping was refused in January 2018.

171540/DPP- Detailed planning permission for erection of two storey detached garage and associated access and landscaping was approved conditionally in April 2018.

APPLICATION DESCRIPTION

Description of Proposal

This application seeks listed building consent for complete demolition of the Steading and Lodge to allow construction of a two storey garage and implementation of associating landscaping within the curtilage of Inchgarth House. The replacement scheme was subject of two separate detailed planning permissions. The first one, proposed as part of 170921/DPP was refused in January 2018 due to inappropriate siting of the proposed garage and detrimental impact on future tree planting. A revised proposal was later submitted as part of 171540/DPP. This application was approved conditionally in March 2018.

Supporting Documents

All drawings and supporting documents listed below can be viewed on the Council's website at:

<https://publicaccess.aberdeencity.gov.uk/online-applications/simpleSearchResults.do?action=firstPage>

The following documents have been submitted in support of the application –

- Bat Survey
- Demolition Statement
- Standing Building Survey Part 01
- Standing Building Survey Part 02

Reason for Referral to Committee

The application has been referred to the Planning Development Management Committee because Cults, Bielside and Milltimber Community Council has objected to the planning application. Accordingly, the application falls outwith the scope of the Council's Scheme of Delegation.

CONSULTATIONS

Historic Environment Scotland (HES) – The response of 15 June 2017 is summarised as below:

- Given the substantial scale and unsympathetic nature of the alterations, which appear to date from the mid to late 20th century, it is considered that the Steading and Lodge would be unlikely to meet the listing criteria in their own right. Accordingly it is acknowledged that a case for their demolition can be justified with regard to national policy on demolition of listed buildings, as set out in Historic Environment Scotland's Policy Statement (HESPS).
- If the Council is satisfied that there is a case for demolition, having regard to HESPS, options should be explored to retain and re-use the original granite parts of the buildings, including the scope to reinstate the traditional form of the lodge and steading, re-affirming their association with the category C listed Inchgarth House.

Community Council - The Cults, Bielside and Milltimber Community Council has formally objected to the application on the grounds that it contravenes Policy D4- Historic Environment and that demolition of two habitable homes which were originally part of the heritage of a Category C listed building within a conservation area is undesirable and unnecessary.

REPRESENTATIONS

None

MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Legislative Requirements

Where a proposal affects a listed building Sections 14(2) and 59(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 places a duty on planning authorities in determining an application for Listed Building Consent to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting and any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. This is the primary consideration in the determination of applications for Listed Building Consent.

National Planning Policy and Guidance

- Scottish Planning Policy (SPP)
- Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement (HESPS)

Aberdeen Local Development Plan (2017)

- Policy D4: Historic Environment
- Policy D5: Our Granite Heritage

Supplementary Guidance and Technical Advice Notes

- Conservation Area Character Appraisal – Pitfodels
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Demolition

EVALUATION

The proposal seeks complete demolition of the existing Lodge and Steading. According to Managing Change in the Historic Environment guidance note on 'Demolition', buildings within the curtilage of a listed building have the same statutory protection. Based on the definition of demolition as provided on this document, the proposed demolition cannot be classified as alterations as it includes total demolition of the buildings.

Policy D4 has a presumption in favour of retention and reuse of listed buildings within conservation areas that contribute to their character. The applicant has stated that the proposed works are part of the wider works that aim to enhance the surroundings of Inchgarth House and that they have considered reuse of the existing buildings into a garage. However, the applicant has expressed that the buildings have featured so much alteration and renovations over the years that they would not be able to be used as a functioning garage. It is also noted that in the wider site, which previously accommodated three residential units, is now converted into one dwelling and no further use as additional residential use is being proposed.

In terms of importance of the buildings, it is noted that the existing semi-detached buildings have been altered considerably from their original form. A number of large box dormers and flat roof extensions have been installed on the buildings and as such the special character of these buildings has extensively been lost. The submitted standing building surveys submitted by the applicant provide evidence of the current state of the buildings both internally and externally and it is considered that there are no internal features with special architectural or historic merits.

According to Policy D5, proposals to demolish any granite building, partially or completely, that is listed or within a Conservation Area will not be granted Listed Building Consent unless the Local Authority is satisfied that the proposals to demolish meets HESPS (Paragraph 3.42) test for demolition. According to this test, evidence should be provided to show that:

- a. the building is not of special interest; or
- b. the building is incapable of repair; or
- c. the demolition of the building is essential to delivering significant benefits to economic growth of the wider community; or
- d. the repair of the building is not economically viable and that it had been marketed at a price reflecting its location and condition to potential restoring purchasers for a reasonable period.

In this instance, it is considered that as a result of accumulation of unsympathetic alterations point (a) has been met. The existing buildings are therefore considered to detract from the special character of Inchgarth House (being of no special character) and their removal is considered acceptable. The applicant has expressed their intention to re-use the reclaimed granite duntakings from the buildings for the reinstatement of part of the boundary wall (as approved in 171540/DPP) and other future ancillary structures or developments within the site.

It should also be noted that the proposal for the replacement building on the footprint of the existing Lodge and Steading has been recently approved conditionally (151540/DPP) and the replacement scheme is considered to maintain the traditional layout of the site and how the main house is read within the site. The proposed garage replicates the form and materials of the recent

extensions to Inchgarth House which keeps the continuity of traditional materials and building form on site. The applicant has

In general terms the setting of Inchgarth House would not be detrimentally harmed. The proposal therefore preserves the historic environment and would not adversely impact on the existing character of Inchgarth House. This authority is satisfied that the works are able to demonstrate compliance with the relevant tests from HESPS and its associated 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment; guidance notes and provisions of policy D4 and D5.

EXTENSION OF TIME

An extension of time has been agreed with the applicant to cover the delay in submission of the proposed application for the replacement scheme (171540/DPP).

RECOMMENDATION

Approve Unconditionally

REASON FOR RECOMMENDATION

The proposed demolition of the Lodge and Steading would remove existing buildings with unsympathetic alterations and with no special character. Thus it is considered that the principal setting of Inchgarth House and its special interest would be preserved in accordance with the principles of Scottish Planning Policy, Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement and Policy D4 (Historic Environment) and D5 (Our Granite Heritage) of Aberdeen Local Development Plan, as well as Historic Environment Scotland's relevant 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment' Guidance Notes.